
**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

Landmark/District:	Cleveland Park Historic District	<input type="checkbox"/> Agenda
Address:	2942 Newark Street NW	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Consent
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Concept
Meeting Date:	September 18, 2014	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Alteration
Case Number:	14-567	<input type="checkbox"/> New Construction
Staff Reviewer:	Frances McMillen	<input type="checkbox"/> Demolition
		<input type="checkbox"/> Subdivision

Applicants Franklin Foer and Abigail Greensfelder, with drawings prepared by Anne Decker Architects, request concept review for a side addition and facade modifications to 2942 Newark Street NW in the Cleveland Park Historic District.

Property Description

Designed by architect Frank Barton and constructed in 1905, 2942 Newark Street NW is a two-story Dutch Colonial style house. The building has undergone several alterations, including the reorientation of the main entrance, removal of the front porch steps, and the addition of a bay window and deck on the east elevation.

Proposal

The proposal calls for removing the wall enclosing the porch and returning the entrance to its original configuration. A central stair would be added to the porch and flagstone lead walk to the house. The proposal also calls for a single-story addition to the east elevation and new windows and doors at the rear of the house.

Evaluation

The addition is compatible with the house and the historic district in terms of overall massing, height, fenestration, and materials. The new porch stairs and lead walk are a welcome change as they will return the entrance to its historic condition. A 1905 property plat included with the proposal documents the original configuration of the porch. The design for the retaining wall and railing at the side entrance is in need of further refinement and the applicant is encouraged to work with staff in finalizing the plans. As the project progresses, it is also recommended the applicant work with staff in selecting the materials for the walk, steps, walls, and railings.

Recommendation

The HPO recommends that the Board find the concept compatible with the historic district and delegate final approval to staff with the condition the applicant consult with HPO on the selection of new railings and the stone for the walk, steps, and new foundation wall.

GOVERNMENT OF THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD



HPRB ACTIONS
September 18 and October 2, 2014

The Historic Preservation Review Board met to consider the following items on September 18 and October 2, 2014.

SEPTEMBER 18 MEETING

Present: Gretchen Pfähler (Chair), Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor. Absent: Rauzia Ally, Robert Sonderman, Charles Wilson.

DOWNTOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT

610-624 I and 609-619 H Street NW, HPA 14-242, revised concept/alterations and additions
[continuation of July 31st meeting for Board deliberation and vote].

The Board found the height and mass to be compatible with the historic district, and the elimination of construction above the east-west alley to be a major improvement in the project concept. The Board accepted the reduced bridge over the north-south alley, but asked that studies be prepared that would reduce the number of connecting floors and eliminate the cantilevers over the alley. The Board determined that greater deference was needed for the retained alley buildings, with less mass and further design work to improve the relationship with the new construction above them, as well as further work to improve the pedestrian experience along the alley. Vote: 6-0.

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

901 L Street, NW, HPA 14-040, revised concept/rehabilitation and construction of 12 story hotel and apartment building.

The Board determined that progress had been made in addressing their previous concerns, particularly in the preparation of the preservation plan, but found a number of aspects of the design to require further work. The feeling was expressed that the project feels like it is working around the historic buildings rather than with them. Specific suggestions for improvement included: 1) more fully incorporating, reusing and reactivating the historic buildings on 9th Street; 2) reinserting all reconstructed floors in 1104 and 1106 9th Street; 3) further design work on the hotel, including reducing the size of the canopy, restudy of the terra cotta screen wall system, making stronger and more varied horizontal breaks on the east and north elevations to break down the mass, and improving its ground level relationship to the historic district; 4) refining the residential building with less sharp of a color differentiation between the base and the top, restudy of the corner glazed element and strengthening the entrance; and 5) restoring the entrance to the Lurgan apartment building. The project should return to the HPRB when ready. Vote: 6-0.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

325 D Street SE, HPA 14-536, concept/rear and side addition and restoration.

The Board found the concept of the side and rear additions and façade restoration compatible
~~with the historic district and consistent with the preservation act with the condition that the~~

applicants move the front most side windows toward the rear, install a mock-up once construction of the addition is underway to ensure the proposed roof deck will not be visible from public space, and work with HPO staff on final selection of materials and façade details.

The Board found the concept of the basement entrance to be incompatible with the Capitol Hill historic district and inconsistent with the preservation act. If a basement entrance is deemed acceptable, the slope of the ramp should be minimized, and removal of the left retaining wall should be studied. Vote: 5-1.

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

1229 E Street SE, HPA 14-435, permit/demolition.

The Board reaffirmed the building is contributing to the Capitol Hill Historic District and found the demolition of the property to be inconsistent with the purposes of the preservation act. The Board recommended denial of the permit to raze the building. The Board urged staff to coordinate resolution of the longstanding issues at the property with other District agencies. Vote: 5-0 (Metzger recused).

900 11th Street SE, HPA 14-527, concept/new construction.

The Board found the concept compatible with the Capitol Hill historic district and consistent with the preservation act with the condition that the applicants work with staff to further refine the façade details and return to the HPRB with an updated design. Vote: 6-0.

ANACOSTIA HISTORIC DISTRICT

1616-1618 U Street SE, HPA 14-610, and 1622 U Street SE, HPA #14-611, concept/construction of a two-story frame houses.

The Board approved the concept, with the conditions that: the entrance recesses be deeper and wider; that the plans and front elevations of 1616 and 1622 U Street be flipped to their mirror image to retain the sense of void between each unit (and an A-B-A-B rhythm); no part of the wood privacy fence be constructed forward of the front wall plane at the entrances of the houses; all front doors to have transoms over them; the drawings be further detailed and dimensioned and show all the trim, meters and landscaping, with the meters not to be located on the fronts of the buildings and the landscaping to address runoff; and the applicant to closely follow their eventual permit drawings in terms of the quality and detail of elements, the dimensions and materials. Further review was delegated to the staff. Vote: 6-0.

2221-2225 Chester Street SE, HPA 14-613, concept/construction of two two-story frame houses.

The Board approved the concept, with the conditions that: the entrance recesses be deeper and wider; that the plan and front elevation of one of the units be flipped to its mirror image to retain the sense of void between each unit a repeating rhythm; no part of the wood privacy fence be constructed forward of the front wall plane at the entrances of the houses; both front doors to have transoms over them; the drawings be further detailed and dimensioned and show all the trim, meters and landscaping, with the meters not to be located on the fronts of the buildings and the landscaping to address runoff; and the applicant to closely follow their eventual permit drawings in terms of the quality and detail of elements, the dimensions and materials. Further review was delegated to the staff. Vote: 6-0.

KALORAMA TRIANGLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1922 Belmont Road NW, HPA 14-518, roof addition.

The HPRB deferred a vote and will hold the record open to allow the ANC to reconsider the case.

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1429 W Street NW, HPA 14-641, concept/rear addition.

The Board found the concept incompatible with the character of the historic district, and directed the applicant to continue design work to accomplish the following: limit the amount of demolition and site excavation; set back the third floor at the rear; and increase the compatibility of the rear elevation. Vote:5-0 (Davidson and Wilson absent)

OCTOBER 2 MEETING

Present: Gretchen Pfahler (Chair), Andrew Aurbach, Maria Casarella, Graham Davidson, Nancy Metzger, Joseph Taylor, Rauzia Ally, Robert Sonderman, Charles Wilson.

HISTORIC LANDMARK

Central Public (Carnegie) Library, 800 K Street NW, HPA 14-254, revisions to concept/building and site alterations, additions. The Board acknowledged that progress had been made on the designs but stressed the need to reduce the size of the pavilions and minimize their presence – particularly along the northern elevation and in terms of distant views. Details related to the pavilions' roof lines, lighting, and content were also requested and the connecting "hyphens" were found to cover too much of the historic façade rather than being made at discreet points along the shorter planes of the library. The Board emphasized the need to increase and improve park space and to preserve elements of the historic landscape and pathway designs. The Board determined that the concepts were still inconsistent with the Act and requested an additional opportunity to review further refinements to the designs. Vote 9-0.

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1772 Church Street NW, HPA 14-530, alteration and 7-story addition for residential building; new construction of church.

The Board found the proposed reuse of the existing ruins within the new church to be an acceptable preservation treatment and the extent of alteration and addition to the parish hall would not compromise its character or constitute demolition as defined in the preservation regulations. The church building was found to be generally compatible in height and size, but that significant further design work was needed to improve its relationship to the historic district, with specific attention needed with regard to the massing, materials use, and the building's base; it was also expressed that the church building should be more distinct and the dominant element in the overall composition. The residential building's height, mass and architectural character should continue to be significantly redesigned to be more residential in character and secondary to the church. Vote: 5-3 (Sonderman absent)

HISTORIC DESIGNATION HEARINGS

George Washington University/Old West End Historic District, Squares 58, 77-81, 101- 104, 121 and 122, Case 14-12.

The Board approved the designation of the historic district for listing in the DC Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 5-0. (Sonderman, Casarella, Davidson and Taylor absent)

First Church of Christ, Scientist, 1770 Euclid Street NW, Case 08-13.

The Board designated the property a landmark in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended that the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 5-0.

Real Estate Trust Company, 1333-1343 H Street NW, Case 11-02.

The Board designated the property a landmark in the D.C. Inventory of Historic Sites and recommended the nomination be forwarded to the National Register of Historic Places. Vote: 5-0.

Hawthorne School, 501 I Street SW, Case 14-18.

The landmark application was withdrawn by the applicant.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS [to be heard if designated]

Hawthorne School, 501 I Street SW, HPA 14-563, raze.

The application was not considered, as the landmark application was withdrawn by the applicant.

Real Estate Trust Company, 1333-1343 H Street, NW, HPA 14-652, concept/alteration of non-contributing addition.

This case was deferred at the request of the applicant.

MOUNT PLEASANT HISTORIC DISTRICT

1716 Kenyon Street NW, HPA 14-639, third-floor addition and rear alterations.

The Board approved the project in concept and delegate to staff further review, with the conditions that:

(A) the addition not be visible from Kenyon Street, with a flag test to be performed and the final construction drawings to adhere to such a test; (B) the front roof, roof ridge, side parapets, chimneys and rooftop mechanical (including vents and stacks) not be modified in ways that can be seen from Kenyon Street; (C) the location of the rear wall of the roof addition be shifted a few feet forward so as not to extend rearward of the end of the masonry ell and that its roof deck be moved forward with it, so that it is not enlarged by the repositioning of the addition; and (D) any other exterior work, including but not limited to window replacements and replacement of the front stairway and porch apron, be detailed for staff review and permit clearance. Vote: 3-1. (Sonderman, Casarella, Davidson, Taylor and Aurbach absent)

FOGGY BOTTOM HISTORIC DISTRICT

2431 I Street NW, HPA 14-625, concept/three-story rear addition to two-story rowhouse.

This case was deferred at the request of the applicant.

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following individual item with comments on the consent calendar on September 18 by a vote of 6-0.

HISTORIC LANDMARKS

National Metropolitan Bank/Metropolitan Square, 655 15th Street, NW, revised concept/façade alteration to 1980s office building

The Board commented that there was more work to be done in addressing their concerns, including documentation and detailing of the metal finishes, detailing and color of the glazing, and the penthouse cladding. The dimensions of the center mullions should continue to be studied and the corners made stronger.

BLAGDEN ALLEY/NAYLOR COURT HISTORIC DISTRICT

928 O Street NW, HPA 14-631, concept/demo non-contributing house, new 3-story building

CAPITOL HILL HISTORIC DISTRICT

234 9th Street SE, HPA 14-456, concept/rear addition

317 7th Street SE, HPA 14-519, concept/rear addition

15 Browns Court SE, HPA 14-534, concept/second-floor demolition and addition

232 9th Street SE, HPA-14-452, concept/rear addition and façade restoration

306 3rd Street SE, HPA 14-622, concept/rear addition

630 D Street NE, HPA 14-448, concept/façade alterations, basement entrance, addition

CLEVELAND PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

3507 Woodley Road NW, HPA 14-618, concept/rear addition

3515 Woodley Road NW, HPA 14-619, concept/rear addition, curb cut, new driveway and garage

[The Board acknowledged the letter and concerns of the ANC in reducing the slope of the driveway and concurred with it.]

2942 Newark Street NW, HPA 14-567, concept/side addition, façade alterations

DOWNTOWN HISTORIC DISTRICT

601 Eye and 900 6th Street, NW, HPA 14-617, concept/addition and alterations

DUPONT CIRCLE HISTORIC DISTRICT

2131 N Street NW, HPA 14-627, 2 story rear addition and trellis

MOUNT VERNON SQUARE HISTORIC DISTRICT

1100 6th Street, NW, HPA 14-360, concept/renovation and additions

SHAW HISTORIC DISTRICT

1514 8th Street, NW, HPA 14-621, concept/alterations to non-contributing 3-floor apartment

SHERIDAN KALORAMA HISTORIC DISTRICT

2111 Florida Avenue, NW (Friends Meeting House), HPA 14-529, concept/addition

[Casarella recused]

U STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1829 13th Street NW, HPA 14-559, concept/roof addition and deck

1459 S Street NW, HPA 14-516, rear addition and roof deck

WOODLEY PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

2701 28th Street NW, HPA 14-614, concept/side addition

2712 Cathedral Avenue NW, HPA 14-647, new garage construction

DENIAL CALENDAR

The Board approved denial of the following item on September 18 without comment by a vote of 6-0.

LEDROIT PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT

1901 4th Street NW, HPA 14-566, concept/roof deck

CONSENT CALENDAR

The Board approved the following item on the consent calendar on October 2 by a vote of 7-0.

14TH STREET HISTORIC DISTRICT

1327 Q Street, NW, HPA 14-557, concept/roof structure and deck; rear alterations

Transcripts of Historic Preservation Review Board Meetings may be purchased from the court reporting agency that covered this hearing – Olender Reporting, Inc. (202) 898-1108, www.olenderreporting.com, or info@OlenderReporting.com. Copies of individual staff reports that are prepared in advance of the hearing are posted on our website at <http://planning.dc.gov>